



CHRIS CHRISTIE
Governor

KIM GUADAGNO
Lt. Governor

New Jersey Office of the Attorney General

Division of Consumer Affairs
State Real Estate Appraisers Board
124 Halsey Street, 3rd Floor, Newark, NJ 07102



JOHN J. HOFFMAN
Acting Attorney General

ERIC T. KANEFSKY
Director

STATE REAL ESTATE APPRAISERS BOARD

PUBLIC SESSION MINUTES

JANUARY 28, 2014

Mailing Address:
P.O. Box 45032
Newark, NJ 07101
(973) 504-6480

The regular meeting of the Board of Real Estate Appraisers was held at 124 Halsey Street on the 3RD Floor on Tuesday, **JANUARY 28, 2014**. The meeting was convened in accordance with the provisions of the Open Public Meeting Act. Board President Mrs. Sharpe called the meeting to order at 9:30 A.M. A roll call was taken and the following attendance was recorded for these minutes:

John A. McCann	Present
Barry J. Krauser	Present
Stephen P. Giocondo	Present
Cheryl A. Randolph-Sharpe	Present
Joseph Palumbo	Present

Also, present were: Barbara Lopez, Deputy Attorney General; Charles Kirk, Acting Executive Director; and Emilio Aviles, staff.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 26, 2013

Following review and discussion by the Board and upon motion of Mr. Palumbo, seconded by Mr. McCann it was determined that the minutes of November 26, 2013 be approved. A vote was taken and the motion was carried, unanimously.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Acting Executive Director, Mr. Charles Kirk made the following announcements:

- *** There were two Investigative Inquiries scheduled for this meeting.
- *** Regulatory Analyst, Rachel Glasgow met with the Board, at this meeting, to discuss the sunset of the Real Estate Appraisers regulations.

It was determined at this meeting a Special Meeting will be conducted in the near future with Ms. Glasgow and the Rules and Regulations committee of the Board to discuss this matter in further detail.

CONTINUING EDUCATION

<u>Provider</u>		<u>Course</u>	<u>Recommendation</u>
Allied Schools	(1)	2014-2015 7-Hour USPAP	7 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(2)	2014-2015 15-Hour USPAP	15 Hrs of Pre-Lic.
	(3)	Real Estate Appraisal Principles & Practices	57 Hrs of C.E. & 60 Hrs. Pre-Lic.
Appraisal University		2014-2015 7-Hour USPAP	7 Hrs. Of C.E.
Dynasty School		2014-2015 7-Hour USPAP	7 Hrs. Of C.E.
McKissock, LP	(1)	2014-2015 15 Hour USPAP	15 Hrs. Of Pre-Lic.
	(2)	Appraisal of Self Storage Facilities	7 Hrs. Of C.E.

Public Session of Minutes of Tuesday, January 28, 2014

	(3)	The Thermal Shell	3 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(4)	Heating, Ventilation and Air Conditioning Systems in Buildings	4 Hrs. Of C.E.
NJ Institute for Continuing Legal Education		Real Estate Tax Appeals: Update 2014	3 Hrs. Of C.E.
NJ NAIFA - Northern Chapter		Cost Approach Seminar	2 Hrs. Of C.E.
NJ NAIFA - Central Chapter		2014-2015 USPAP Update	7 Hrs. Of C.E.
Northeast NJ Appraisal Institute		NJ Appraiser Law - Realities & Myths	2 Hrs. Of C.E.
Metro NJ Appraisal Institute		Property Tax Appraisal of Complex Industrial Facilities	2 Hrs. Of C.E.
Delaware Chapter of Appraisal Institute		Delaware Subdivision Overview & Appraisal Technique	2 Hrs. Of C.E.
Cumberland - Salem Chapter of NAIFA		Septic 101	2 Hrs. Of C.E.
Appraisal Seminars	(1)	2014-2015 USPAP Update Course	7 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(2)	2014-2015 USPAP Course	15 Hrs. Of Pre-Lic.
Otteau Valuation Group, Inc.		2014 Spring Housing Market Workshop	2.5 Hrs. Of C.E.
CLE International		Eminent Domain Update	7 Hrs. Of C.E.

Public Session of Minutes of Tuesday, January 28, 2014

ASFMRA (1) Introduction to Commercial Greenhouse Appraisals **8 Hrs. Of C.E.**

(2) Income Approach Applications **8 Hrs. Of C.E.**

RENEWALS

Appraisal Institute (1) Advanced Spreadsheet Modeling & Valuation Application **15 Hrs. Of C.E.**

(2) Online General Appraiser Market Analysis & Highest & Best Use **28 Hrs. Of C.E. & 30 Hrs. Of Pre-Lic.**

ASFMRA (1) Introduction to the Appraisal Review **14 Hrs. Of C.E.**

(2) Appraisal Review under USPAP **22 Hrs. Of C.E.**

(3) Integrated Approaches to Value (A304) **27 Hrs. Of C.E. & 30 Hrs. Of Pre-Lic.**

Van Education Center (1) Basic Appraisal Principles **29 Hrs. Of C.E. & 30 Hrs. Of Pre-Lic.**

(2) Basic Appraisal Procedures **29 Hrs. Of C.E. & 30 Hrs. Of Pre-Lic.**

(3) Residential Report Writing Case Studies **14.5 Hrs. Of C.E. & 15 Hrs. Of Pre-Lic.**

(4) Residential Site Valuation & Cost Approach **14.5 Hrs. Of C.E. & 15 Hrs. Of Pre-Lic.**

(5) Appraisal Subject Matter Electives **19 Hrs. Of C.E. & 20 Hrs. Of Pre-Lic.**

Public Session of Minutes of Tuesday, January 28, 2014

	(6)	Fundamentals of Commercial Real Estate	7 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(7)	Planning 101	5 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(8)	Residential Environmental Hazards Screening	6.5 Hrs. Of C.E. w/o exam - 7 Hrs. Of C.E. w/exam
	(9)	Yield Capitalization (Discounting)	4 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(10)	URAR	7 Hrs. Of C.E.
Dynasty School		Residential Market Analysis & Best Use	14 Hrs. Of C.E. & 15 Hrs. Of Pre-Lic.
Las Vegas Chapter of Appraisal Institute		The Discounted Cash Flow Model: Concepts, Issues, Applications	7 Hrs. Of C.E.

INDIVIDUAL REQUEST

Stephen Rushmore	(1)	Hotel Valuation - Tools & Techniques for Real Estate (Metro NY Chapter of A.I.)	7 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(2)	Hotel Valuation - A Case Study in Room Night Analysis (Columbia Society of Real Estate Appraisers)	3 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(3)	Hotel Valuation & Transaction Trends (Massachusetts Chapter of Appraisal Institute)	2 Hrs. Of C.E.

Public Session of Minutes of Tuesday, January 28, 2014

	(4)	Latest Techniques & Software for Performing Hotel Market Studies & Valuations (Pennsylvania State University)	18 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(5)	An Appraiser's Introduction & Overview of the USPAP	3 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(6)	Hotel Market Studies & Valuations Using HVS Hotel Valuation Software (South Florida Chapter of A.I.)	4 Hrs. Of C.E.
Ross M. Raimond	(1)	Online FHA and the Appraisal Process	7 Hrs. Of C.E.
	(2)	7 Hour USPAP Update	7 Hrs. Of C.E.
Thomas J. Grouss		Integra Real Resources Certified Reviewer Seminar	7 Hrs. Of C.E.
Sung Lee		NCREIF Fall Conference	15 Hrs. Of C.E.
Robert Ruggles		NCREIF Fall Conference	15 Hrs. Of C.E.

Following review and discussion by the Education Committee of the Board and upon motion of Mr. Palumbo, seconded by Mr. Krauser it was determined that the C.E. Courses, Renewals and Individual Requests listed above did meet the established criteria for the designated approved hours and that they be approved as noted above. A vote was taken and the motion was carried, unanimously

APPRAISAL FOUNDATION

APPRAISAL STANDARDS BOARD

- *** **USPAP Q & A - November 25, 2013** - re: 2013-08: ETHICS RULE - Confidentiality “Subject Property Data and Confidentiality”

- *** **Memo dated 1-7-14 from Barry J. Shea, Chair of the Appraisal Standards Board re:** First Exposure Draft of proposed changes for the 2016-17 edition of the *Uniform Standards of Professional Appraisal Practice*.

- *** **USPAP Q & A - January 14, 2014** - re: 2014-01: ETHCIS RULE - CONFIDENTIALITY “Verifying” Completion of an Appraisal.

- *** **The next public meeting of the Appraisal Standards Board (ASB)** - Friday, February 21, 2014 at the Embassy Suites International Drive/Convention Center, 8978 International Drive, Orlando, Florida 32819.

The Board review, discussed and duly noted the above items.

APPRAISAL QUALIFICATIONS BOARD

- *** **AQB Q & A** - December, 2013 - Vol. 5, No. 2.

The Board reviewed, discussed and duly noted the above items.

APPRAISAL PRACTICES BOARD

- *** **Memo dated 12-5-13 from Rick Baumgardner, Chair of the Appraisal Practices Board re:** Exposure Draft - The Valuation of Customer-Related Assets.

- *** **Solicitation for Subject Matter Experts (SMEs):** Valuation of Green Buildings: **Residential** Properties - application deadline is February 14, 2014.

Public Session of Minutes of Tuesday, January 28, 2014

- *** **Solicitation for Subject Matter Experts (SMEs):** Valuation of Green Buildings: **Non-Residential** Properties - application deadline is February 14, 2014.

- *** **The Appraisal Foundation Seeks Candidates for Vacancies on the Appraisal Practices Board** - application deadline is March 10, 2014

The Board review, discussed and duly noted the above items.

LEGISLATION

- *** **Senate, No. 3058 - State of New Jersey, 215th Legislature, Introduced November 18, 2013** - “Permits real estate licensees to prepare broker price opinions and comparative market analyses.

- *** **Assembly, No. 4494 - State of New Jersey, 215th Legislature, Introduced November 25, 2013** - “Permits real estate licensees to prepare broker price opinions and comparative market analyses..

The Board review, discussed and duly noted the above items.

DISCIPLINARY ACTIONS TAKEN

IMO --- LEE A. DOMBROWSKI - Consent Order Filed December 4, 2013 imposing:

- *** Reprimand
- *** Successful completion of a 15 Hour USPAP Course
- *** Successful completion of a 15 Hour Residential Report Writing and Case Studies Course
- *** \$1,500.00 Civil Penalty
- *** \$308.00 in Costs

The Board review, discussed and duly noted the above Order.

OTHER

- *** **Petition for reconsideration of a Final Order of Discipline from Mr. Peter Doughty.** Note: Mr. Doughty received a Final Order of Discipline on February 20, 2013 for his failure to comply or respond to the Board's request regarding the continuing education audit for the 2010-2011 cycle. He license has been suspended \$3,500.00 Civil Penalty was imposed. He has responded advising that he has completed the continuing education requirement within the cycle and is requesting that his license be reinstated and the order be dismissed.

Follow deliberation in the Executive Session of this matter and upon motion of Mr. Giocondo, seconded by Mr. Krauser it was determined that a Demand For Statement In Writing Under Oath be forwarded to Mr. Doughty to clarify certain concerns in which the Board had. Upon receipt and review of Mr. Doughty's response a further determination will be made. A vote was taken and the motion was carried, unanimously.

- *** **Email from SDAG Flanzman for review and discussion re:** a Recent Appellate Division Decision in which the Real Estate Appraisal Board can relate to "...in addressing and clarifying standards regarding administrative process generally and standards applicable when a Board receives an initial decision from the OAL"

Due to the absence of SDAG Flanzman this matter was tabled for discussion at the February 25th Board Meeting.

PENDING APPLICATIONS

Gerald B. Cohenr (RC)

Adel Metri (RA)

Jamie R. Stafford (RC)

David T. Vadurro (RC)

James H. Crupi (RC)

Alexander Santangelo (RA)

Emily C. Sze (RG)

Robert E. Wasenius (RG)

Following review and discussion by the Board of the above noted applicants and upon motion of Mr. McCann, seconded by Mr. Krauser it was determined that the above noted candidates did meet the established criteria for Licensure and that their applications be approved. A vote was taken and the motion carried, unanimously.

Public Session of Minutes of Tuesday, January 28, 2014

PUBLIC COMMENT

Bruce Shapiro and Robert Solotist, Al Chanese Rich Seibel and Daniel Drelich of the Appraisal Community addressed the Board with issues of mutual concern.

ADJOURNMENT

Upon motion of Mr. McCann, seconded by Mr. Palumbo it was determined that the Public Meeting be adjourned at 11 A.M. and the Board proceed to the Executive Session. A vote was taken and the motion carried, unanimously.

Respectfully submitted,

CHARLES F. KIRK

For the Board